

RULES, ENACTMENTS & INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
Held In Room 318
PUTNAM COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING
CARMEL, NEW YORK 10512

Members: Chairman Sullivan and Legislators Addonizio & Albano

Tuesday **6:30pm** **November 13, 2018**

The meeting was called to order at 6:34pm by Chairman Sullivan who requested that Legislator Addonizio lead in the Pledge of Allegiance. Upon roll call Legislators Addonizio & Albano and Chairman Sullivan were present.

Item #3 - Approval of Minutes – September 17, 2018 Rules Committee Meeting
October 11, 2018 Rules Budget Meeting
October 15, 2018 Additional Rules Budget Meeting

The minutes were approved as submitted.

**Item #4 - Approval/ Inter-Municipal Agreement with the County of Orange/
Reciprocity of Master Electrician Licensing**

County Attorney Jennifer Bumgarner stated this reciprocal licensing agreement will permit individuals who have met all requirements to possess a valid master electricians license in the County of Orange to obtain a reciprocal license in Putnam County, and vice versa. She stated the Putnam County Electrical Examiners Board approved this inter-municipal agreement (IMA) because the minimum qualifications in Orange County were equal to or better than Putnam County. She stated this would be valid for a term of one (1) year, renewable annually for up to three (3) additional years. She stated this IMA is very similar to other inter-municipal agreements that Putnam currently has with other municipalities.

John Morrison stated he is present tonight as a representative of the Putnam County Electrical Contractors Association. He stated he is also a member of the Putnam County Electrical Examiners Board (Board). He requested that the Committee not approve this IMA because it is not a fair deal. He stated the requirements put forth by both counties are the same; however he recently became aware that while Orange County contractors will be permitted to work anywhere in Putnam County, Putnam County contractors cannot work within the cities in Orange County (Newburgh, Middletown, and Port Jervis) because they have their own licensing. He stated contractors within the cities in Orange County will already have their license through Orange County and will therefore be able to come into Putnam County under this IMA. He stated he would be in favor of this IMA if Putnam County were achieving reciprocity with all municipalities at once; Orange County and the three (3) cities.

Legislator Addonizio questioned what the population of Orange County is without the cities.

Mr. Morrison stated he is unaware.

Chairman Sullivan stated the cities are often where the bigger jobs are as there are more large scale buildings. He questioned how the other members feel about this IMA.

Mr. Morrison stated they are all against it.

Legislator Nacerino stated before approving such an IMA, it is important to find what the advantages are and what the need is. She stated in order to make an informed decision she would like to see information about how many contractors would be taking advantage of the IMA.

Chairman Sullivan questioned where this IMA originated.

Mr. Morrison stated Orange County sent the request to Putnam County.

Chairman Sullivan stated if the Electrical Examiners Board is against it he does not see any reason to move it forward.

Legislator Albano stated if the requirements are the same, reciprocal licenses make sense as they allow contractors to perform the same work in different areas without having to apply for and pay the fee for an additional license. He stated in a perfect world, a State wide license would benefit contractors for the same reason. He questioned if the three cities in Orange County; Newburgh, Middletown, and Port Jervis, could be excluded from this IMA.

Mr. Morrison stated excluding those areas from this IMA would not solve the problem because the contractors within those cities also have an Orange County license, meaning they would still work in Putnam County if this IMA were to be approved. He stated within the past few years Orange County implemented a county-wide license and grandfathered in all contractors who had a license through their local municipality.

Legislator Addonizio questioned how Putnam County contractors could work in Newburgh, Middletown, or Port Jervis.

County Attorney Bumgarner stated Putnam County would have to approve reciprocal agreements with those three (3) individual cities.

Legislator Nacerino questioned how often Putnam County contractors would go into Orange County to do work. She stated it is more advantageous for the Orange County contractors to infiltrate Putnam. She questioned what the benefit of this IMA is.

Legislator Albano stated the reciprocal licensing would be a convenience for contractors. He stated a contractor from Putnam County could accept work in Orange County without having to obtain an additional license through Orange County.

Legislator Nacerino stated the advantage of the IMA should be balanced between both municipalities.

Chairman Sullivan state he is surprised that this request originated from Orange County because he would think that there is more development than building in Orange County than in Putnam County.

Legislator Gouldman suggested tabling this item until more information can be collected.

Legislator Albano suggested sending a response to Orange County notifying them that Putnam is receptive to this request but has concerns about the three (3) cities.

Mr. Morrison stated he would rather see Orange County sort this out with the three (3) cities if they want the reciprocity with Putnam County.

Legislator Castellano questioned if the Putnam County Board of Electrical Examiners originally approved this IMA.

Mr. Morrison stated yes, it was voted through the Board to come before the Legislature with only two (2) members voting against it. He stated he is here tonight because this was brought to the Electrical Contractors Association and they were against it.

County Attorney Bumgarner questioned if Mr. Morrison was here speaking on behalf of the Putnam County Board of Electrical Examiners.

Mr. Morrison stated no, he is present as a representative of the Electrical Contractors Association.

Legislator Castellano suggested sending this item back to the Board.

Chairman Sullivan stated he would like to have the Chairman of the Electrical Board either attend the next Rules Meeting or send something in writing in regards to this IMA.

Chairman Sullivan made a motion to table the Inter-Municipal Agreement with the County of Orange for Master Electrician Licensing Reciprocity; Seconded by Legislator Addonizio. All in favor.

Item #5 - Approval/ Litigation Settlement/ Ferruccio v. County of Putnam, et al.

Chairman Sullivan stated this item will be moved to the end of the agenda.

**Item #6 - Approval/ Re-Appointments/ Plumbing & Mechanical Trades Board/
Boyd & Losee**

Legislator Albano made a motion to pre-file the necessary resolution; Seconded by Chairman Sullivan. All in favor.

**Item #7 - Approval/ Re-Appointment/ Plumbing & Mechanical Trades Board/
Lyons**

Chairman Sullivan made a motion to pre-file the necessary resolution; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

**Item #8 - Approval/ Appointment/ Election Commissioner/ Republican Party/
Scannapieco**

Chairman Sullivan made a motion to pre-file the necessary resolution; Seconded by Legislator Addonizio. All in favor.

Item #9 - Approval/ Appointment/ Election Commissioner/ Democratic Party/ Croft

Chairman Sullivan made a motion to pre-file the necessary resolution; Seconded by Legislator Addonizio. All in favor.

**Item #10 - Discussion/ Permission for Legislature to Attend Conferences,
Seminars, & Official Business of the County**

Legislator Nacerino stated this year there were multiple conferences that were costly and she believes it would be in the best interest of the taxpayers to limit the number of conferences that each legislator can attend on a yearly basis. She stated taking into consideration the legislators' salaries plus the cost of each conference, it becomes very expensive, especially if multiple conferences are attended by a single legislator. She stated in the interest of saving taxpayer dollars, she believes it would be fair and equitable to allow each legislator to attend one (1) NYSAC conference and one (1) other conference each calendar year. She stated each conference costs about \$600-\$800 per legislator, not including mileage or meal reimbursement. She believes it would be prudent for the Legislature to consider limiting the number of conferences each legislator may attend. She stated there is always information to be learned by attending the NYSAC conferences, however there is also redundancy.

Chairman Sullivan requested clarification on the proposed resolution. He stated it states "Legislators may attend a maximum of one (1) NYSAC conference and one (1) other conference..." He questioned if the other conference could be the second NYSAC conference.

Legislator Nacerino stated no, it would permit one (1) NYSAC Conference.

Chairman Sullivan questioned if a legislator were to attend the first NYSAC conference and then decide not to go to any other conferences throughout the year, if they would be permitted to go to the second NYSAC Conference.

Legislator Nacerino stated the reason why the proposed resolution was written this way was because the two (2) NYSAC conferences are the ones held annually, giving legislators the option of one or the other in any calendar year. She stated if another conference opportunity arises, such as the White House Conference that took place in August this year, legislators could attend in addition to one (1) NYSAC conference. She stated this does not include workshops or daily seminars that may be scheduled. She stated a conference can cost about \$800 per legislator, therefore the investment that goes toward one (1) legislator attending multiple conferences becomes very costly for the taxpayers.

Legislator Gouldman questioned if this has been abused in the past.

Legislator Nacerino stated it is less a point of abuse and more a point of being fiscally prudent. She stated if a legislator goes to both NYSAC conferences, the total cost is about \$1,600. She stated it becomes very costly for any one legislator to attend several conferences in one calendar year.

Legislator Albano stated a lot of information is obtained at the conferences. He stated there are usually only a few legislators attending at once. He stated he has not seen this to be an issue. He stated the information learned at the conferences can be a tremendous benefit.

Legislator Nacerino agreed with Legislator Albano and stated that there is also redundant information. She stated she believes attending either the January or September conference every other year would suffice. She stated there is always information to bring back, but at what cost. She stated the legislators make about \$41,000 per year and then the cost of going to the conferences are added on to that. She stated she does not believe this is fiscally prudent. She stated in her opinion, if the legislators were to alternate which conferences they attend, it sends a good message to the taxpayers.

Chairman Sullivan understands Legislator Nacerino's concern about trying to keep the costs under control. He stated when he attends a conference; it means he has to take time off from his full-time job. He stated legislators are not attending the conferences "just to go," rather they are hoping to learn new things and improve their knowledge relating to County issues. He stated sending legislators to these conferences is an investment for the County.

Legislator Nacerino stated she sees the advantage of the conferences, but believes the cost can be decreased. She stated she believes one (1) NYSAC conference per year would be sufficient because there is some redundancy and down time. She stated from a fiscal standpoint, this would be a good measure.

Legislator Castellano stated he understands the points made by Legislator Nacerino. He stated he has been on the Legislature for six (6) years and has gone to two (2) NYSAC conferences in Albany. He stated the conferences were well run and he learned a lot. He stated although he has not been able to attend any September NYSAC conferences, he would not want to be restricted in the future if there was a topic of interest to him on the agenda. He stated this discussion puts great attention on this matter. He stated the legislators need to make the personal decision when the opportunity arises. He stated speaking for himself, he does not believe he has abused the opportunities to attend conferences and he wishes he was able to attend more.

Legislator Albano stated he looks forward to the conferences, which were especially helpful as a new legislator. He stated the conferences serve as a type of continuing education. He stated the conference can be costly, however not all legislators attend each one.

Legislator Nacerino stated it also offers an imbalance for some legislators to incur extra costs as compared to other legislators who are unable to attend the conferences.

Legislator Sayegh stated this is her first year on the Legislature and she attend both NYSAC conferences this year and found them to be very beneficial. She stated she believes it is her duty as a Legislator to collect as much information as possible in order to perform her job for the residents of Putnam County. She stated as Legislator Nacerino mentioned earlier, there is down time at the conferences, however she found this beneficial as well because it provides an opportunity to make connections with officials from other municipalities and agencies.

Legislator Nacerino stated she is not underscoring the importance of any training or advantages obtained at the conferences. She stated she is concerned with the cost per legislator in each calendar year, especially when the salaries are taken into consideration.

Legislator Castellano suggested rather than limiting the number of conferences in a calendar year, perhaps the conferences could be limited within a legislator's three (3) year term. He stated it could be set that no more than four (4) conferences can be attended within a three (3) year term or something to that effect.

Legislator Nacerino stated when she discussed this with Legislative Counsel Robert Firriolo it was determined that implementing this based on term was difficult.

Legislative Counsel Firriolo stated it was difficult to implement based on the staggered terms of the Legislature, however if it were to be based on each legislator's individual term, it could be implemented. He stated in this case, a record would need to be kept by the staff.

Legislator Addonizio stated NYSAC holds two (2) annual conferences, one (1) in January and one (1) in September. She questioned if there are any other annual conferences.

Legislator Castellano stated the County is a member of NACo (National Association of Counties), which also holds conferences.

Legislator Addonizio stated NACo holds conferences very far away and Putnam County Legislators have not attended any of those.

Legislator Albano stated he would like if one (1) member of the Legislature attended the NACo conference because the information gained can be very valuable.

Chairman Sullivan stated as it is currently written, the proposed resolution states each legislator can attend two (2) total conferences each year, but only one (1) NYSAC conference. He stated he would be in favor of limiting each legislator to attending two (2) conferences per year; however both could be NYSAC conferences.

Legislator Addonizio questioned how many legislators have gone to the September conference in recent years.

Legislator Nacerino stated there are some legislators that go to the conferences and some that do not go at all. She stated therefore, some legislators are incurring more of an expense, especially when one (1) legislator goes to three (3) conferences in the same year.

Chairman Sullivan stated it is rare to have three (3) conferences in one (1) year.

Deputy Legislative Clerk Diane Trabulsy stated traditionally, in the past legislators would go to one (1) NYSAC conference. She stated there was also one (1) particular Legislator who paid their own expenses for the conferences. She stated there have been different scenarios and this year the addition of the White House Conference was out of the ordinary.

Legislator Nacerino stated she is not diminishing the need for or benefit of these conferences, but there should be a limit. She stated the taxpayers should not bear the fiscal impact of the extra cost for everyone to be traveling, lodging, and attending these conferences. She stated attending one (1) conference would certainly suffice.

Legislator Castellano reiterated his suggestion to limit the number of conferences by term rather than by calendar year. He stated this would allow each legislator to review the agendas for all conferences and choose which ones are of interest, even if they occur in the same year.

Chairman Sullivan stated if this resolution were approved, he questioned what would happen in the case where the opportunity for a third conference presented itself. He questioned if this would be addressed in committee.

Legislator Nacerino expressed her concern with Legislator Castellano's suggestion of limiting the number of conferences per legislator by term. She stated a situation could arise where a legislator exhausts their allotment within their term, and then decide they would really like to attend a conference that comes up. She stated because there are two (2) NYSAC conferences, going to just one (1) would suffice and then if another conference came up, a legislator could attend that one as well. She stated attending all conferences and therefore spending extra money on top of the salaries is a bit much.

Chairman Sullivan stated he does not believe conference attendance has been abused. He stated he does not believe there is a need to pass this proposed resolution through.

Legislator Addonizio requested a list of how many legislators have attended the September NYSAC Conference over the past few years.

Chairman Sullivan stated he does not usually go to two (2) conferences within a year. He stated the conference in Washington, DC this year was a rare opportunity.

Legislator Nacerino stated there are some legislators who attended both NYSAC conferences and the conference in Washington, DC.

Chairman Sullivan stated there are some legislators who did not attend any conferences this year. He stated there is a certain amount of funding budgeted for this purpose. He stated there are many important topics to learn about at the conferences, such as shared services.

Legislator Albano stated the ProAct program, which provides prescription cost assistance to Putnam County residents originated from a NYSAC conference. He stated he learned about this program and brought information back to be reviewed by the Health, Social, Educational, & Environmental Committee. He stated Putnam County joined and this program has been a tremendous benefit to the residents.

Legislator Nacerino stated her concern about how to properly utilize the budgeted money for this purpose. She stated it offers an imbalance for legislators as well. She stated if a legislator is interested in a topic on the conference agenda but is unable to take time off of their full time job to attend it can put them at a disadvantage.

Legislator Albano stated in that case the legislator or legislators that do attend can bring information back to the rest of the Legislature when they return. He stated attending the conferences is not a vacation, it is an educational seminar. He stated there are usually only a few legislators that attend at once. He stated upon returning, the information gained at the conference is shared with the rest of the Legislature.

Legislator Nacerino stated perhaps the Legislature should vote to send one (1) or two (2) representatives per conference. She stated she would not be comfortable being a Legislator, making the salary she makes, and incurring \$2,000-\$3,000 on top of that for any given district. She stated she does not believe this works to anyone's advantage in the long run.

Chairman Sullivan thanked Legislator Nacerino for bringing this forward.

Legislator Castellano suggested that this item be tabled until next month and requested a chart be made showing conference information over the past six (6) years.

Legislator Addonizio stated she would like to see what is done in other counties as well.

Item #11 - Update/ Veteran's Service Medal Advisory Panel

Legislator Castellano stated payments have been made to the artist and they are expecting the 400 medals in the near future. He stated the Panel will be meeting again this week. He hopes to give the first set of medals of shortly.

Eric Gross, resident, questioned how many medals have been given out so far.

Legislator Castellano stated no medals have been distributed yet. He stated 400 medals have been ordered and they hope to give them out in the near future. He stated they have 200 applications so far.

Item #5 - Approval/ Litigation Settlement/ Ferruccio v. County of Putnam, et al. - Continued

Item #12 - FYI/ Litigation Report

At 7:14pm Chairman Sullivan made a motion to go into executive session to discuss Item #12 FYI/ Litigation Report and Item #5 Approval/ Litigation Settlement/ Ferruccio v. County of Putnam, et al.; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

At 7:56 Chairman Sullivan made a motion to come out of executive session; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

No action was taken in executive session.

Item #5 - Approval/ Litigation Settlement/ Ferruccio v. County of Putnam, et al. - Continued

Chairman Sullivan made a motion to pre-file the necessary resolution; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

Item #13 - Other Business – None

Item #14 - Adjournment

There being no further business at 7:56pm, Chairman Sullivan made a motion to adjourn; Seconded by Legislator Albano. All in favor.

Respectfully submitted by Administrative Assistant, Beth Green.